



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Day of the Ordeal," "The Way of God with the Nation," and "The Way of God with the Individual" interpret the spiritual meaning of war. Why the war? "It is because Europe, while Christian in name, has remained essentially pagan in its public policy—its nations on the whole following the natural lusts, and only playing with the principle of human brotherhood, that the Continent which was the chosen home of civilization has been transformed into a chaos and an Inferno." He is no blinded patriot, but sets forth the struggle in the light of history and God's purpose of good. "If analogy may be trusted, the unexampled conflict should bring a harvest of spiritual results. The great struggles of the past have often been followed by a remarkable stimulation of the higher life of humanity, and by the subsequent appearance of a generation of great men. We already see the beginnings of a moral conversion. The mark of the children of the new age will surely be that self will be less central in their thinking than it was in ours. We may also confidently look forward to a fresh outpouring of the Holy Spirit" (p. 262).

ARTHUR S. HOYT

AUBURN THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

---

## INDIAN AND IRANIAN MYTHS

There are no satisfactory scholarly works which treat the development of Indian or Iranian mythology in a historical way. Keith and Carnoy are to be congratulated on the success of these first attempts at a synthesis.<sup>1</sup> Both accounts well fulfil their purpose as popular summaries; both will also prove valuable to specialists. Keith and Carnoy have both contributed much in the past to the solution of special problems of detail, but both have also been interested in the general development of ideas and have tried to trace the bearing of details on the more general problems involved. The judgment of the former is sober and keeps very close to facts; the latter is more speculative and venturesome in the projection of facts into theories.

Keith devotes two chapters to the Rig-Veda, one to the Brāhmaṇas, two to the Epic, one to the Purāṇas, one to Buddhism, one to Jainism, one to Modern Hinduism. Carnoy divides his treatment of Iranian myths into discussions of the wars of gods and demons, of myths of

<sup>1</sup> *The Mythology of All Races*. Vol. VI: *Indian* by A. B. Keith; *Iranian* by A. J. Carnoy. Boston: Marshall Jones Co., 1917. ix+404 pages, 5 figs., 44 pls. \$6.00.

creation, of the primeval heroes, of legends of Yima, of traditions of the kings and Zoroaster, and of the life to come. Fourteen pages of notes refer to passages in the sources or give references on disputed points. Thirty-four pages are devoted to a carefully chosen bibliography, including a digest of all the articles in Hastings' *Encyclopaedia* which bear on Indian and Iranian mythology.

Keith keeps strictly to the main line of mythology and offers little on the development of myth to legend, folklore, and traditional history. Carnoy devotes much space to this latter development in the Persian epic. In India the material is so vast and the historical background so obscure that no treatment of the subject could be satisfactory at present. Much of the material of the so-called Indian mythology is Dravidian or Munda rather than Aryan, but it is impossible, as yet, to distinguish Aryan from Dravidian with any certainty.

The most satisfactory chapters of Keith are those on the Rig-Veda, the Brāhmaṇas, and the Epic. The mythology of the Purāṇas, of modern Hinduism, and of Jainism is sketched cursorily in only the broadest and most general outlines. The chapter on Buddhism, the most difficult one to write, is the least satisfactory of all. Here Keith's touch is much less firm and sure than in the earlier chapters. Keith feels assured (p. 188) that no Buddhist text can be proved to be as early as two hundred years after Buddha's death. So much can be granted, but, if this assumption is made, it is impossible to argue, as Keith does, that we have in the Pāli canon "the authority of Buddha himself" for several important mythological details. In India myth and legend develop with amazing rapidity, and two hundred years are not to be dismissed lightly. If no text can be assigned positively to the period within two hundred years after Buddha's death, there is no certainty that the important mythological matters assigned in the texts to Buddha himself can be earlier than two hundred years after the death of Buddha. It is becoming more and more certain that the Pāli texts represent the ideas of only one sect. Different groups of monks interpreted the enigmatical teachings of Buddha according to their own thoughts and feelings. The Pāli canon does not give us the unified tradition of Buddhism before the early split into sects. Much that is represented as the utterance of Buddha himself may be due to speculative accretion generations after his death. The "thus I have heard" is no more proof of originality than the corresponding formula in the Mahāyāna texts. Further, many elements in the life of Buddha himself, if the traditions are based on any real memories of the Master, show that he himself lived a life

of ministry nearer in many ways to the Bodhisattva ideal of the Mahāyāna than to the Arhat ideal of the Hinayāna.

Both Keith and Carnoy (pp. 5, 25, 30, 263-65) refer to the names found in the Hittite tablets at Boghaz-keui as Indo-Iranian and draw from them important conclusions concerning the relation of Indo-Iranian to Babylonian mythology. The reviewer has tried to show in an article in the *American Journal of Semitic Languages and Literatures* (1917, pp. 261-82) that the matters involved are, as yet, purely linguistic ones on which no historical conclusions should be based.

Keith argues here, as elsewhere, that Krishna was originally a vegetation-god become anthropomorphic. He is over-skeptical of the possibility of men becoming gods in India. The classical prejudice against euhemerism is invalid in Hindu mythology. In the case of Krishna it is much easier to explain the mythology as a later accretion (as in the cases of Buddha and Mahāvīra) than as fundamental. The reviewer can interpret the figure of Krishna in the epic only as a man deified. Thae Krishna (son of Devakī) of the Chāndogya Upanishad 3, 17, 6 cannot be lightly dismissed as not identical with Krishna (son of Devakī) of the Epic just because the identification invalidates a theory that Krishna must be a sun-god or a vegetation-god. The passage in Patanjali (150-140 B.C.), which Keith (p. 126) interprets as proving the performance of a vegetation rite in connection with Krishna, does not disprove the theory that Krishna was originally a human figure. Where among the vaguely anthropomorphic figures of early Hindu mythology is there one which has become so human, so concrete in outline, as the Krishna of the epic? Rāma, perhaps? But it is by no means certain that Rāma is a purely mythical figure.

On page 177 Keith follows Garbe in interpreting the Çvetadvīpa story as having reference to contact of the Hindus with a Nestorian community, settled on an island in Lake Balkash. The recent evidence concerning the Nestorians collected by Pelliot in *T'oung Pao* (1914, pp. 623-44) conclusively disproves Garbe's theory, at least so far as present evidence goes. Garbe's arguments against Weber's identification of Çvetadvīpa with Alexandria are conclusive. The story seems to be purely mythological. It may belong to the same development which resulted in the descriptions of Sukhāvātī in the Buddhist texts. There is no need of interpreting dvīpa as referring to any actual island. It may be connected with the dvīpas of Hindu and Jain cosmology.

Carnoy has done well to call attention to the many curious coincidences between Iranian myths on the one hand and Indian and

Babylonian myths on the other. Little can be deduced from such coincidences at present, but some day, when more historical evidence is available, comparisons such as these will be of the greatest value.

WALTER EUGENE CLARK

UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

---

### BRIEF MENTION

BROWN, WILLIAM ADAMS. *Modern Missions in the Far East*. A Report Prepared by Professor Brown, as Union Seminary Lecturer on Religion in the Far East, for the Board of Directors of the Union Theological Seminary, New York. 1917. 76 pages. Circulation private.

The importance of this report greatly outweighs its size. It gives us the reflections of a scholar and a theologian who is keenly alive to the innumerable problems and demands of the modern missionary movement and who writes from first-hand evidence. Some of his suggestions are worthy of especial cognizance, as, e.g.: (1) the need for a readjustment of missionary administration by more frequent visits to the fields on the part of executive officials of the boards, or, failing that, placing greater responsibility on the resident missionaries; (2) the ever-increasing demand for co-operation among the various Christian bodies on the field; (3) the moral demand that institutions for higher education on the field must be efficient; (4) the conviction that, as theology needs restatement in the light of actual experience, the mission field will make a real contribution to this restatement; (5) the unique opportunity for Christian forces to play a creative rôle in the work of social and economic reform by applying Christian ideals to the regeneration of the social order; (6) the opening for an organization modeled after the Young Men's Christian Association to operate on the family as a unit; (7) the economic and spiritual waste involved in the time of missionaries being so occupied with clerical duties that they have no leisure for research work which they are peculiarly fitted to do; (8) the supreme need of the discovery and training of strong personalities who shall become Christian leaders among their own peoples; (9) the contribution which the theological seminary can make (*a*) by furnishing facilities for the training of missionaries, the advanced training of missionaries on furlough and of selected leaders of the native church, (*b*) by setting apart one or more representatives of the faculty for at least part-time service on the field, and (*c*) by promoting a healthy public sentiment in the church at home.

A. S. W.

HARTMAN, L. O. *Popular Aspects of Oriental Religions*. New York: Abingdon Press, 1917. 255 pages. \$1.35.

The title of this volume expresses its precise nature. It is composed of six studies in the great oriental religions, viz., Korean animism, Chinese Taoism and Confucianism, Hinduism, Buddhism, Islam, and Zoroastrianism. In so short a volume it would be impossible to give a comprehensive treatment of so vast a field, and the author